


A close-up portrait of Steven Pinker, an older man with white curly hair, smiling slightly. He is wearing a dark suit jacket over a white shirt.

**STEVEN  
PINKER**

A classical architectural scene featuring a large stone archway supported by two columns. The archway is set against a bright, golden sky with scattered clouds. Several birds are in flight, some entering and some exiting the archway.

**MORALITY  
WITHOUT GOD**

1  
00:00:05,869 --> 00:00:03,590  
it it really is a terrible idea

2  
00:00:07,579 --> 00:00:05,879  
to try to change the meaning so that

3  
00:00:10,820 --> 00:00:07,589  
people can't even get certain thoughts

4  
00:00:15,980 --> 00:00:10,830  
across so if you ask is it possible for

5  
00:00:18,710 --> 00:00:15,990  
a white powerless unemployed

6  
00:00:23,439 --> 00:00:18,720  
working-class person in a poor southern

7  
00:00:25,730 --> 00:00:23,449  
in order Appalachian town to be have

8  
00:00:28,130 --> 00:00:25,740  
derogatory opinions about

9  
00:00:30,380 --> 00:00:28,140  
african-americans and you say oh no we

10  
00:00:38,060 --> 00:00:30,390  
can't ask if he's racist because racist

11  
00:00:41,660 --> 00:00:38,070  
means power hi professor it's a pleasure

12  
00:00:43,490 --> 00:00:41,670  
to meet you nice to meet you I'm Kurt

13  
00:00:45,350 --> 00:00:43,500

I'm uncle the director this is Peter and

14

00:00:46,760 --> 00:00:45,360

he's helping me tag-team this interview

15

00:00:49,600 --> 00:00:46,770

okay very good

16

00:00:52,189 --> 00:00:49,610

pleasure to meet you nice to meet you

17

00:00:56,950 --> 00:00:52,199

okay so is it all ready if we just get

18

00:01:00,549 --> 00:00:58,959

starting off I want to know what is the

19

00:01:02,560 --> 00:01:00,559

left we have to define the left and I

20

00:01:05,109 --> 00:01:02,570

would like you to give its defining

21

00:01:07,090 --> 00:01:05,119

traits its characteristics it's hard to

22

00:01:09,580 --> 00:01:07,100

give a definition because political

23

00:01:12,070 --> 00:01:09,590

ideologies turn into tribes and so

24

00:01:13,450 --> 00:01:12,080

people affiliate with those in the group

25

00:01:16,149 --> 00:01:13,460

they like to interact with that they

26  
00:01:18,010 --> 00:01:16,159  
valued morally and nowadays especially

27  
00:01:20,830 --> 00:01:18,020  
the United States it's harder and harder

28  
00:01:22,870 --> 00:01:20,840  
to discern a common intellectual thread

29  
00:01:24,609 --> 00:01:22,880  
behind the left and the right we see

30  
00:01:29,880 --> 00:01:24,619  
that especially in the rough it's where

31  
00:01:32,830 --> 00:01:29,890  
you have pro-russian anti-free trade

32  
00:01:35,529 --> 00:01:32,840  
right-wingers all go in the mind of

33  
00:01:39,100 --> 00:01:35,539  
anyone who was a right-wing or even 10

34  
00:01:41,560 --> 00:01:39,110  
years ago also vote the left has

35  
00:01:44,830 --> 00:01:41,570  
switched in a number of its affiliations

36  
00:01:48,880 --> 00:01:44,840  
but I would use it informally in a way

37  
00:01:51,279 --> 00:01:48,890  
that people tend to identify those who

38  
00:01:54,010 --> 00:01:51,289

are sympathetic with with socialism

39

00:01:56,109 --> 00:01:54,020

those who tend to be at least in

40

00:01:57,700 --> 00:01:56,119

American politics more likely to be the

41

00:01:59,559 --> 00:01:57,710

Democratic Party than the Republican

42

00:02:01,899 --> 00:01:59,569

Party there are a number of positions

43

00:02:04,719 --> 00:02:01,909

that go with it but they can often be

44

00:02:07,630 --> 00:02:04,729

blurred as the coalition's themselves

45

00:02:09,249 --> 00:02:07,640

Ricola less would you identify with or

46

00:02:14,410 --> 00:02:09,259

do you identify with someone who's on

47

00:02:17,560 --> 00:02:14,420

the Left no I certainly don't identify

48

00:02:19,530 --> 00:02:17,570

with the right and most people would

49

00:02:22,509 --> 00:02:19,540

identify me based on my positions as

50

00:02:25,140 --> 00:02:22,519

center left in terms of them I believe

51  
00:02:28,890 --> 00:02:25,150  
in a graduated income tax I believe in

52  
00:02:35,020 --> 00:02:28,900  
regulations on environmental

53  
00:02:39,190 --> 00:02:35,030  
despoliation I agree I'm in favor of

54  
00:02:41,050 --> 00:02:39,200  
from social programs like welfare and

55  
00:02:44,140 --> 00:02:41,060  
medicine on the other hand I also

56  
00:02:47,110 --> 00:02:44,150  
believe in the importance of markets I

57  
00:02:51,360 --> 00:02:47,120  
believe in the primacy of free speech

58  
00:02:54,900 --> 00:02:51,370  
and individual rights I believe that

59  
00:02:57,280 --> 00:02:54,910  
policing is an important component of

60  
00:02:59,680 --> 00:02:57,290  
reduction of violence which is not a

61  
00:03:03,520 --> 00:02:59,690  
popular view on the left so I have an

62  
00:03:05,800 --> 00:03:03,530  
eclectic mix which I examine on an

63  
00:03:07,569 --> 00:03:05,810

issue-by-issue basis and evaluate in

64

00:03:10,449 --> 00:03:07,579

terms of my best reading of the evidence

65

00:03:11,000 --> 00:03:10,459

but I try not to fall into an ideology

66

00:03:14,149 --> 00:03:11,010

or quite

67

00:03:17,690 --> 00:03:14,159

left there seems to be a considerable

68

00:03:19,220 --> 00:03:17,700

overlap recognizing these differences in

69

00:03:26,030 --> 00:03:19,230

your opinion when does the left go to

70

00:03:28,520 --> 00:03:26,040

far you know let's say a number of ways

71

00:03:30,890 --> 00:03:28,530

is especially the contemporary left has

72

00:03:36,890 --> 00:03:30,900

tended to gravitate toward identity

73

00:03:38,750 --> 00:03:36,900

politics toward seeing debate and

74

00:03:41,690 --> 00:03:38,760

analysis of social issues in terms of

75

00:03:44,119 --> 00:03:41,700

the relative power of different ethnic

76

00:03:46,099 --> 00:03:44,129

groups and races and seeing social

77

00:03:48,710 --> 00:03:46,109

progress in terms of rectifying and

78

00:03:52,670 --> 00:03:48,720

imbalance between whites and blacks or

79

00:03:54,440 --> 00:03:52,680

men and women as opposed to recognizing

80

00:03:56,660 --> 00:03:54,450

discrimination that has occurred but

81

00:03:59,180 --> 00:03:56,670

striving toward a society in which

82

00:04:00,830 --> 00:03:59,190

people are evaluated based on their

83

00:04:03,379 --> 00:04:00,840

individual rights and their individual

84

00:04:07,280 --> 00:04:03,389

merits so identity politics and with

85

00:04:10,250 --> 00:04:07,290

that a a relativistic epistemology that

86

00:04:12,289 --> 00:04:10,260

says that your opinions are determined

87

00:04:14,660 --> 00:04:12,299

to by your race your gender your sexual

88

00:04:17,689 --> 00:04:14,670

orientation your handicap status as

89

00:04:20,390 --> 00:04:17,699

opposed to their internal consistency

90

00:04:22,850 --> 00:04:20,400

and support by evidence

91

00:04:26,330 --> 00:04:22,860

I think there's far too much hostility

92

00:04:28,810 --> 00:04:26,340

to markets into capitalism on the left

93

00:04:31,969 --> 00:04:28,820

is given the historical and contemporary

94

00:04:34,850 --> 00:04:31,979

rector of which societies one we want to

95

00:04:37,689 --> 00:04:34,860

Riven North Korea versus South Korea

96

00:04:45,110 --> 00:04:37,699

West Germany versus East Germany

97

00:04:46,670 --> 00:04:45,120

Venezuela vs. Uruguay for example let's

98

00:04:52,400 --> 00:04:46,680

see though well those are old I think

99

00:04:55,879 --> 00:04:52,410

the as I mentioned before the hostility

100

00:04:59,240 --> 00:04:55,889

on the left to rule of law and law

101  
00:05:02,029 --> 00:04:59,250  
enforcement is inconsistent with their

102  
00:05:04,159 --> 00:05:02,039  
role of policing in reducing violent

103  
00:05:08,510 --> 00:05:04,169  
crime that be another issue that the

104  
00:05:12,980 --> 00:05:08,520  
left I think has lost touch with with

105  
00:05:15,770 --> 00:05:12,990  
facts and the importance of market

106  
00:05:18,589 --> 00:05:15,780  
economies in elevating societies from

107  
00:05:21,050 --> 00:05:18,599  
extreme poverty the fact that global

108  
00:05:22,969 --> 00:05:21,060  
extreme poverty has declined by 75

109  
00:05:24,760 --> 00:05:22,979  
percent in the last 30 years largely

110  
00:05:26,469 --> 00:05:24,770  
because of liberalisation

111  
00:05:30,760 --> 00:05:26,479  
market economies in countries like China

112  
00:05:34,320 --> 00:05:30,770  
and Vietnam and India so those are a

113  
00:05:36,129 --> 00:05:34,330

number of issues in which the left has

114

00:05:38,920 --> 00:05:36,139

gone off the tracks

115

00:05:45,510 --> 00:05:38,930

but the contemporary American right is

116

00:05:50,860 --> 00:05:48,490

integrating international agreements and

117

00:05:53,409 --> 00:05:50,870

norms which are increasingly going to be

118

00:05:56,770 --> 00:05:53,419

necessary to confront global challenges

119

00:06:02,620 --> 00:05:56,780

like climate change the hostility to any

120

00:06:05,950 --> 00:06:02,630

form of regulation even ones that would

121

00:06:10,029 --> 00:06:05,960

be justified by a market friendly

122

00:06:11,770 --> 00:06:10,039

mindset such as pricing harm to the

123

00:06:13,689 --> 00:06:11,780

environment which even if you're a

124

00:06:19,020 --> 00:06:13,699

staunch capitalist utilize the market

125

00:06:24,490 --> 00:06:19,030

itself will not take care of the

126

00:06:26,950 --> 00:06:24,500

indifference to the the plight of people

127

00:06:30,129 --> 00:06:26,960

who can't contribute enough to a market

128

00:06:33,520 --> 00:06:30,139

economy to support a decent way of life

129

00:06:35,920 --> 00:06:33,530

the difference today to the poor to the

130

00:06:39,300 --> 00:06:35,930

sick after the elderly and therefore a

131

00:06:42,850 --> 00:06:39,310

rather ideological opposition to all

132

00:06:44,680 --> 00:06:42,860

forms of government assistance to the to

133

00:06:47,529 --> 00:06:44,690

the needy we just know again there's

134

00:06:49,990 --> 00:06:47,539

nothing that dictates that you have to

135

00:06:52,060 --> 00:06:50,000

be hostile to social programs if you're

136

00:06:54,059 --> 00:06:52,070

sympathetic to markets because it's just

137

00:06:56,320 --> 00:06:54,069

a basic of

138

00:06:59,499 --> 00:06:56,330

analysis of markets that they don't

139

00:07:02,200 --> 00:06:59,509

provide for for the poor so unless you

140

00:07:04,089 --> 00:07:02,210

just are happy to let the cooler starve

141

00:07:06,610 --> 00:07:04,099

and die of disease you have to have

142

00:07:08,770 --> 00:07:06,620

markets you have to have mechanisms that

143

00:07:11,080 --> 00:07:08,780

the market doesn't provide it is hardly

144

00:07:15,670 --> 00:07:11,090

radical eating if you are a free market

145

00:07:18,580 --> 00:07:15,680

libertarian sorry you've done some work

146

00:07:20,320 --> 00:07:18,590

with the heterodox Academy right I guess

147

00:07:22,570 --> 00:07:20,330

that's right I gave the keynote at their

148

00:07:24,999 --> 00:07:22,580

last meeting for example have you seen

149

00:07:26,620 --> 00:07:25,009

the rise of the campus left do you see

150

00:07:28,719 --> 00:07:26,630

it as becoming more extreme in the past

151

00:07:30,249 --> 00:07:28,729

few years and and can you give some

152

00:07:33,730 --> 00:07:30,259

examples of that if you do see it as

153

00:07:35,409 --> 00:07:33,740

becoming more extreme yeah I think it I

154

00:07:38,589 --> 00:07:35,419

think it has although as I said in my

155

00:07:41,469 --> 00:07:38,599

address contra contra Billy Joel we did

156

00:07:43,810 --> 00:07:41,479

start the fire we did the baby boomers

157

00:07:47,320 --> 00:07:43,820

and there were episodes of intolerance

158

00:07:49,180 --> 00:07:47,330

and shutting down of free speech when I

159

00:07:52,269 --> 00:07:49,190

was an undergraduate number of decades

160

00:07:55,600 --> 00:07:52,279

ago I think there is an increase in the

161

00:08:01,390 --> 00:07:55,610

number of speakers who are decided who

162

00:08:02,769 --> 00:08:01,400

are shouting down with loud protests

163

00:08:05,740 --> 00:08:02,779

sometimes physical alteration

164

00:08:09,310 --> 00:08:05,750

altercations with the setting of fire

165

00:08:11,800 --> 00:08:09,320

alarms and we also know just by

166

00:08:15,370 --> 00:08:11,810

surveys of a political affiliation of

167

00:08:16,480 --> 00:08:15,380

professors that they are drifting rather

168

00:08:18,730 --> 00:08:16,490

sharply to the left

169

00:08:20,890 --> 00:08:18,740

in many humanities departments there are

170

00:08:23,769 --> 00:08:20,900

more Marxists than there are people who

171

00:08:27,670 --> 00:08:23,779

identify as conservatives why do you

172

00:08:30,790 --> 00:08:27,680

think that is some of it is because of

173

00:08:34,810 --> 00:08:30,800

an increase in social and residential

174

00:08:37,990 --> 00:08:34,820

segregation that people with higher

175

00:08:40,149 --> 00:08:38,000

amounts of education will live with

176

00:08:43,060 --> 00:08:40,159

other people who are just like them and

177

00:08:47,319 --> 00:08:43,070

people particularly in on college

178

00:08:48,550 --> 00:08:47,329

campuses or in large cities and people

179

00:08:52,030 --> 00:08:48,560

who are more conservative

180

00:08:55,480 --> 00:08:52,040

tend to be more in the suburbs exurbs in

181

00:08:58,300 --> 00:08:55,490

rural areas partly because academia has

182

00:09:01,449 --> 00:08:58,310

some I think some pathologies in terms

183

00:09:04,360 --> 00:09:01,459

of people hiring people like themselves

184

00:09:07,410 --> 00:09:04,370

so that once there was a generation that

185

00:09:10,060 --> 00:09:07,420

got tenure in many departments they

186

00:09:14,079 --> 00:09:10,070

replicated themselves hired people with

187

00:09:16,350 --> 00:09:14,089

the same so those are a couple of the

188

00:09:18,699 --> 00:09:16,360

reasons is there's also a natural

189

00:09:21,370 --> 00:09:18,709

there's a I think a natural affinity

190

00:09:23,650 --> 00:09:21,380

among intellectuals for more liberal

191

00:09:25,630 --> 00:09:23,660

positions some of the justified it was

192

00:09:29,579 --> 00:09:25,640

often liberals and leftists who are at

193

00:09:32,410 --> 00:09:29,589

the forefront of social movements that

194

00:09:35,110 --> 00:09:32,420

universally now I take for granted and

195

00:09:39,730 --> 00:09:35,120

that we now enjoy such as racial

196

00:09:43,600 --> 00:09:39,740

equality gender equality and gay rights

197

00:09:45,850 --> 00:09:43,610

so some degree of liberal filters may be

198

00:09:52,350 --> 00:09:45,860

a good thing but when it comes to

199

00:09:57,760 --> 00:09:54,730

recognising that universities are not

200

00:10:01,420 --> 00:09:57,770

structured in a totalitarian fashion and

201

00:10:04,180 --> 00:10:01,430

that there still are orthodoxies in

202

00:10:06,880 --> 00:10:04,190

universities and taboos some of which

203

00:10:09,760 --> 00:10:06,890

you have touched on do you believe that

204

00:10:15,040 --> 00:10:09,770

universities follow a propaganda model

205

00:10:17,680 --> 00:10:15,050

or would you not go that far no I mean I

206

00:10:19,900 --> 00:10:17,690

think there are tendencies in some

207

00:10:22,170 --> 00:10:19,910

disciplines in some departments toward

208

00:10:25,180 --> 00:10:22,180

replicating with particular ideologies

209

00:10:27,220 --> 00:10:25,190

the other hand a lot of members of the

210

00:10:31,260 --> 00:10:27,230

heterodox Academy are university

211

00:10:34,690 --> 00:10:31,270

professors a lot of the responses to

212

00:10:38,170 --> 00:10:34,700

campus suppression come from campuses so

213

00:10:40,660 --> 00:10:38,180

it is not it is not utilitarian it is

214

00:10:43,660 --> 00:10:40,670

not a propaganda Factory you had

215

00:10:46,840 --> 00:10:43,670

mentioned a variance by discipline in

216

00:10:48,040 --> 00:10:46,850

terms of how ideological these

217

00:10:50,950 --> 00:10:48,050

disciplines become that there's a

218

00:10:53,260 --> 00:10:50,960

variance what explains this variance why

219

00:10:57,040 --> 00:10:53,270

are certain disciplines more ideological

220

00:10:59,260 --> 00:10:57,050

let's say than others this is purely

221

00:11:01,030 --> 00:10:59,270

speculative but I think disciplines that

222

00:11:03,150 --> 00:11:01,040

are closer to the sciences tend to be a

223

00:11:05,710 --> 00:11:03,160

little less ideological because there is

224

00:11:09,310 --> 00:11:05,720

at least a commitment and sometimes the

225

00:11:11,110 --> 00:11:09,320

reality of holding your beliefs to a

226

00:11:15,550 --> 00:11:11,120

caracal account to see which of your

227

00:11:19,120 --> 00:11:15,560

beliefs survive empirical tests whereas

228

00:11:22,120 --> 00:11:19,130

in disciplines where that is not on a

229

00:11:24,550 --> 00:11:22,130

norm or an ideal or an aspiration they

230

00:11:28,690 --> 00:11:24,560

can be more justyou force of personality

231

00:11:30,790 --> 00:11:28,700

charisma rhetoric that can preserve

232

00:11:33,490 --> 00:11:30,800

certain beliefs against a possible

233

00:11:35,590 --> 00:11:33,500

falsification I remember you were

234

00:11:37,570 --> 00:11:35,600

talking about the effects of political

235

00:11:40,390 --> 00:11:37,580

correctness in the form of a backlash a

236

00:11:42,430 --> 00:11:40,400

rise of the right like a counter

237

00:11:44,380 --> 00:11:42,440

position and you already mentioned that

238

00:11:45,940 --> 00:11:44,390

the right seems to pose a greater threat

239

00:11:47,920 --> 00:11:45,950

right now can you talk about the

240

00:11:49,930 --> 00:11:47,930

relationship why is it that why is it is

241

00:11:52,120 --> 00:11:49,940

it necessary that when the left gets too

242

00:11:55,420 --> 00:11:52,130

out of hand and the right does something

243

00:11:57,750 --> 00:11:55,430

similar that's not exactly the argument

244

00:11:59,670 --> 00:11:57,760

it's more that when opinions get

245

00:12:02,999 --> 00:11:59,680

suppressed

246

00:12:07,460 --> 00:12:03,009

and people who might even be reasonable

247

00:12:09,960 --> 00:12:07,470

same opinion suppress suspect that the

248

00:12:12,989 --> 00:12:09,970

academia or whatever form it is can't

249

00:12:16,049 --> 00:12:12,999

handle the truth that bear if they can't

250

00:12:18,030 --> 00:12:16,059

show why a position is wrong why it

251  
00:12:19,919 --> 00:12:18,040  
seemed coherent why is contradicted by

252  
00:12:20,910 --> 00:12:19,929  
the facts but they just fed it out

253  
00:12:22,439 --> 00:12:20,920  
completely

254  
00:12:23,759 --> 00:12:22,449  
they suspect well there must be

255  
00:12:24,689 --> 00:12:23,769  
something to that idea because if

256  
00:12:26,369 --> 00:12:24,699  
there's something wrong with it they

257  
00:12:28,199 --> 00:12:26,379  
could just show it's what was wrong we

258  
00:12:31,199 --> 00:12:28,209  
wouldn't have to squelch it and so they

259  
00:12:35,730 --> 00:12:31,209  
can retreat to their own bubbles we're

260  
00:12:38,280 --> 00:12:35,740  
much more extreme and dogmatic and

261  
00:12:41,929 --> 00:12:38,290  
categorical and unsubtle versions of the

262  
00:12:46,819 --> 00:12:41,939  
hypothesis can that I can confess her

263  
00:12:48,900 --> 00:12:46,829

unopposed by people who might be more

264

00:12:51,299 --> 00:12:48,910

conversant with it with the data and the

265

00:12:55,559 --> 00:12:51,309

counter arguments so they can be a kind

266

00:13:01,919 --> 00:12:55,569

of malignant mirror image of campus

267

00:13:03,179 --> 00:13:01,929

orthodoxy in both write orthodoxy now by

268

00:13:06,210 --> 00:13:03,189

the way the reason that I think that the

269

00:13:07,860 --> 00:13:06,220

right is worse is because they they have

270

00:13:09,239 --> 00:13:07,870

power I mean their senators they're the

271

00:13:13,769 --> 00:13:09,249

governor's they're the President and

272

00:13:16,790 --> 00:13:13,779

though the right-wing orthodoxy is much

273

00:13:19,290 --> 00:13:16,800

more dangerous than professors and

274

00:13:21,569 --> 00:13:19,300

students shutting out speakers in

275

00:13:24,150 --> 00:13:21,579

universities but they do they can feed

276

00:13:30,840 --> 00:13:24,160

each other where a lot of the so let me

277

00:13:35,189 --> 00:13:30,850

just be concrete there are universities

278

00:13:40,350 --> 00:13:35,199

there is often a hostility and a lack of

279

00:13:42,480 --> 00:13:40,360

comprehension of market economies now in

280

00:13:43,919 --> 00:13:42,490

reality there is no such thing as a

281

00:13:47,009 --> 00:13:43,929

market economy that does not have

282

00:13:49,129 --> 00:13:47,019

regulation and social transfers

283

00:13:52,970 --> 00:13:49,139

redistribution that's just the

284

00:13:56,009 --> 00:13:52,980

libertarian fantasy of a perfect

285

00:13:57,749 --> 00:13:56,019

anarcho-capitalist free market country

286

00:14:00,509 --> 00:13:57,759

where the government does nothing but

287

00:14:03,900 --> 00:14:00,519

enforce contracts and prevent the use of

288

00:14:05,189 --> 00:14:03,910

force does not exist and good reasons

289

00:14:07,280 --> 00:14:05,199

why it doesn't exist there are number of

290

00:14:11,070 --> 00:14:07,290

reasons why it's not level but um

291

00:14:15,090 --> 00:14:11,080

because often those on

292

00:14:22,070 --> 00:14:15,100

I campus assume that capitalism and free

293

00:14:28,230 --> 00:14:24,450

capitalism is pretty much a dirty word

294

00:14:33,240 --> 00:14:28,240

on campus then get a hard-line

295

00:14:35,610 --> 00:14:33,250

libertarian rebound we're in a lot of

296

00:14:37,830 --> 00:14:35,620

the American right there's hostility to

297

00:14:40,470 --> 00:14:37,840

all regulation of hostility to all

298

00:14:42,990 --> 00:14:40,480

redistribution often resulting in the

299

00:14:46,020 --> 00:14:43,000

gutting of completely justifiable

300

00:14:50,840 --> 00:14:46,030

mechanisms of regulation or or social

301  
00:14:53,970 --> 00:14:50,850  
programs a reaction to the uncritical

302  
00:14:57,560 --> 00:14:53,980  
hostility to capitalism on the campus

303  
00:15:02,130 --> 00:14:57,570  
left so any it's unhealthy when you have

304  
00:15:04,620 --> 00:15:02,140  
such a lack of nuance a lack of

305  
00:15:07,170 --> 00:15:04,630  
compromise a lack of discussion and you

306  
00:15:08,670 --> 00:15:07,180  
get polarized extremes and we're seeing

307  
00:15:11,730 --> 00:15:08,680  
that in politics or the one hand

308  
00:15:14,070 --> 00:15:11,740  
universities on the other let's get into

309  
00:15:15,840 --> 00:15:14,080  
some cognitive science I remember you

310  
00:15:17,880 --> 00:15:15,850  
were suggesting that we have some leeway

311  
00:15:19,590 --> 00:15:17,890  
or some elasticity in our brain for what

312  
00:15:21,210 --> 00:15:19,600  
we categorized as an in-group versus an

313  
00:15:23,190 --> 00:15:21,220

out-group obviously because none of us

314

00:15:25,800 --> 00:15:23,200

were around each other a million years

315

00:15:27,930 --> 00:15:25,810

ago or ten thousand years ago but that

316

00:15:30,270 --> 00:15:27,940

this but the identity politics somehow

317

00:15:33,020 --> 00:15:30,280

undermines that or or takes advantage of

318

00:15:40,800 --> 00:15:33,030

it in a negative manner can you explain

319

00:15:44,310 --> 00:15:40,810

this one of the core beliefs of the of

320

00:15:48,750 --> 00:15:44,320

the earth right of the ban in Breitbart

321

00:15:52,220 --> 00:15:48,760

Trump version of modern nationalism is

322

00:15:56,880 --> 00:15:52,230

that we are hard-wired to fall into

323

00:15:59,280 --> 00:15:56,890

tribes that the idea of a global

324

00:16:03,560 --> 00:15:59,290

civilization of transnational

325

00:16:06,750 --> 00:16:03,570

organizations is utopian is futile

326

00:16:08,970 --> 00:16:06,760

because we evolved as tribal creatures

327

00:16:12,090 --> 00:16:08,980

now I think we do have tribal instincts

328

00:16:13,980 --> 00:16:12,100

but what counts as a tribe is highly

329

00:16:15,870 --> 00:16:13,990

elastic and certainly not a race because

330

00:16:18,690 --> 00:16:15,880

in our evolutionary ancestry would

331

00:16:20,070 --> 00:16:18,700

seldom have encountered a person driven

332

00:16:23,640 --> 00:16:20,080

off the race link so you couldn't have a

333

00:16:24,540 --> 00:16:23,650

built-in hostility other races only as

334

00:16:27,420 --> 00:16:24,550

time

335

00:16:30,570 --> 00:16:27,430

more to some notion of coalition or clan

336

00:16:35,220 --> 00:16:30,580

people who are on a side who might have

337

00:16:37,320 --> 00:16:35,230

some fictive relatedness that that makes

338

00:16:40,949 --> 00:16:37,330

them seem like one brothers or or or

339

00:16:42,569 --> 00:16:40,959

like families but that the idea that

340

00:16:44,880 --> 00:16:42,579

this coincides with a modern

341

00:16:47,190 --> 00:16:44,890

nation-state with the United States of

342

00:16:49,710 --> 00:16:47,200

America or France is I think

343

00:16:51,750 --> 00:16:49,720

anachronistic we have multiple tribal

344

00:16:53,639 --> 00:16:51,760

affiliations were loyal to our

345

00:16:56,220 --> 00:16:53,649

University to our sports team to our

346

00:16:59,100 --> 00:16:56,230

state or province to our country and

347

00:17:01,350 --> 00:16:59,110

that there it's not that we categorize

348

00:17:04,230 --> 00:17:01,360

ourselves as belonging to one and only

349

00:17:07,260 --> 00:17:04,240

one tribe equals nation which is in

350

00:17:09,569 --> 00:17:07,270

locked in zero-sum competition with

351

00:17:12,829 --> 00:17:09,579

other nations and that is the basis of

352

00:17:15,409 --> 00:17:12,839

crumb pused foreign policy

353

00:17:16,669 --> 00:17:15,419

okay for our viewers for the people

354

00:17:18,470 --> 00:17:16,679

watching this can you define the

355

00:17:21,279 --> 00:17:18,480

enlightenment broadly speaking what are

356

00:17:24,049 --> 00:17:21,289

the values of the Enlightenment well the

357

00:17:25,699 --> 00:17:24,059

there's no official definition because

358

00:17:27,350 --> 00:17:25,709

it didn't they weren't like opening

359

00:17:29,960 --> 00:17:27,360

closing ceremonies there's no membership

360

00:17:33,259 --> 00:17:29,970

card so there really is no definition

361

00:17:39,950 --> 00:17:33,269

it's it's a term that's loosely applied

362

00:17:42,019 --> 00:17:39,960

to as a movement to a number of thinkers

363

00:17:43,810 --> 00:17:42,029

in the sec typically in the second half

364

00:17:48,070 --> 00:17:43,820  
or second two-thirds of the 18th century

365

00:17:53,590 --> 00:17:48,080  
primarily in England Scotland America

366

00:17:58,389 --> 00:17:53,600  
and Germany it tends to include a

367

00:18:02,289 --> 00:17:58,399  
embrace of science skepticism toward

368

00:18:08,859 --> 00:18:02,299  
religion and scripture an emphasis on

369

00:18:12,619 --> 00:18:08,869  
the power of reason and of human rights

370

00:18:15,049 --> 00:18:12,629  
when I referred to enlightenment ideals

371

00:18:18,139 --> 00:18:15,059  
I spell it out in the subtitle of my

372

00:18:22,070 --> 00:18:18,149  
book I mean the reason science humanism

373

00:18:24,739 --> 00:18:22,080  
and progress now I don't claim that that

374

00:18:25,759 --> 00:18:24,749  
is the correct definition of the

375

00:18:27,859 --> 00:18:25,769  
arrangement I don't care what the

376

00:18:31,129 --> 00:18:27,869

correct definition is there isn't one I

377

00:18:33,590 --> 00:18:31,139

wrote a defense of Reason science

378

00:18:36,560 --> 00:18:33,600

humanism and progress I used

379

00:18:38,299 --> 00:18:36,570

enlightenment as a loose label form I

380

00:18:40,639 --> 00:18:38,309

could have also called it secular

381

00:18:43,580 --> 00:18:40,649

humanism we're gonna call it cosmic

382

00:18:45,980 --> 00:18:43,590

power liberalism enlightenment ideals

383

00:18:48,310 --> 00:18:45,990

were attached here but nothing is at

384

00:18:51,739 --> 00:18:48,320

stake over whether the term is correct

385

00:18:53,960 --> 00:18:51,749

in that case let us dive into some of

386

00:18:57,440 --> 00:18:53,970

these ideas particularly progress and

387

00:18:59,359 --> 00:18:57,450

humanism to start I think it's fair to

388

00:19:02,180 --> 00:18:59,369

say that the term progress is very long

389

00:19:04,519 --> 00:19:02,190

and diverse history history philosophy

390

00:19:06,590 --> 00:19:04,529

in the interest of synchronizing our

391

00:19:08,810 --> 00:19:06,600

metric we'd like to touch on the

392

00:19:10,399 --> 00:19:08,820

similarities and differences of your

393

00:19:13,879 --> 00:19:10,409

view of progress and its previous

394

00:19:16,489 --> 00:19:13,889

historical usage for example the

395

00:19:19,909 --> 00:19:16,499

philosopher of progress Hegel believed

396

00:19:23,149 --> 00:19:19,919

that material substance conformed to a

397

00:19:25,900 --> 00:19:23,159

sort of set inevitable ideological track

398

00:19:28,930 --> 00:19:25,910

and that this was how history were

399

00:19:31,090 --> 00:19:28,940

a sort of unfolding of material on a set

400

00:19:33,160 --> 00:19:31,100

course of ideas and that this was

401  
00:19:35,890 --> 00:19:33,170  
inevitable but this seems to conflict

402  
00:19:38,770 --> 00:19:35,900  
with your view of progress would you

403  
00:19:41,350 --> 00:19:38,780  
agree absolutely yeah well when I think

404  
00:19:43,180 --> 00:19:41,360  
of progress it's not that but it is

405  
00:19:48,610 --> 00:19:43,190  
honest but where does your view of

406  
00:19:52,270 --> 00:19:48,620  
progress differ first of all I deny that

407  
00:19:55,690 --> 00:19:52,280  
there exists a force dynamic dialectic

408  
00:19:57,580 --> 00:19:55,700  
that we can call progress the human

409  
00:19:59,770 --> 00:19:57,590  
condition does not have progress built

410  
00:20:03,400 --> 00:19:59,780  
then quite the contrary

411  
00:20:06,660 --> 00:20:03,410  
the University is a different trust kind

412  
00:20:09,250 --> 00:20:06,670  
of grinds us down both three forces of

413  
00:20:12,370 --> 00:20:09,260

of entropy the growth of natural growth

414

00:20:15,840 --> 00:20:12,380

disorder and the process of evolution

415

00:20:18,820 --> 00:20:15,850

which is a competitive process where

416

00:20:22,450 --> 00:20:18,830

various germs and parasites and

417

00:20:24,610 --> 00:20:22,460

pathogens and pestilence organisms and

418

00:20:27,190 --> 00:20:24,620

spoilage organisms are always trying to

419

00:20:31,990 --> 00:20:27,200

do us in either way in our well-being

420

00:20:35,260 --> 00:20:32,000

and the only way to progress happens in

421

00:20:38,710 --> 00:20:35,270

the teeth of all of these forces pushing

422

00:20:40,420 --> 00:20:38,720

against it is the extent to which humans

423

00:20:42,870 --> 00:20:40,430

use ingenuity that is their

424

00:20:46,240 --> 00:20:42,880

understanding of how the world works and

425

00:20:48,400 --> 00:20:46,250

they deploy it in the service of

426  
00:20:50,550 --> 00:20:48,410  
improving human wellbeing where human

427  
00:20:54,940 --> 00:20:50,560  
well-being would include health

428  
00:20:57,370 --> 00:20:54,950  
happiness prosperity freedom stimulation

429  
00:20:59,920 --> 00:20:57,380  
the social ties are the kind of things

430  
00:21:01,690 --> 00:20:59,930  
that the people like and want to the

431  
00:21:03,700 --> 00:21:01,700  
extent that the kind of things that

432  
00:21:05,950 --> 00:21:03,710  
people like and want improve over the

433  
00:21:08,290 --> 00:21:05,960  
course of time that's progress and what

434  
00:21:10,030 --> 00:21:08,300  
makes it possible is humans solving

435  
00:21:11,530 --> 00:21:10,040  
problems deploying their understanding

436  
00:21:15,670 --> 00:21:11,540  
of the world to make other humans better

437  
00:21:17,290 --> 00:21:15,680  
off thank you we're just trying to make

438  
00:21:19,450 --> 00:21:17,300

sure that our viewers understand how

439

00:21:22,060 --> 00:21:19,460

your view of Progress differs from let's

440

00:21:24,280 --> 00:21:22,070

say the traditional if there is one view

441

00:21:26,500 --> 00:21:24,290

of progress and to the rest absolutely

442

00:21:29,590 --> 00:21:26,510

it's extremely important because people

443

00:21:30,730 --> 00:21:29,600

often confuse them and indeed the notion

444

00:21:34,600 --> 00:21:30,740

that I have a problem is actually rather

445

00:21:35,110 --> 00:21:34,610

simple and boring one namely if people

446

00:21:37,450 --> 00:21:35,120

live longer

447

00:21:39,700 --> 00:21:37,460

that's progress people are less likely

448

00:21:41,620 --> 00:21:39,710

to be murdered that's progress

449

00:21:44,410 --> 00:21:41,630

if women can do what they want to do

450

00:21:47,730 --> 00:21:44,420

that's progress so the Enlightenment

451  
00:21:49,900 --> 00:21:47,740  
thinkers in the early enlightenment high

452  
00:21:51,970 --> 00:21:49,910  
technological progress to ideological

453  
00:21:53,950 --> 00:21:51,980  
progress arguing that the two go

454  
00:21:58,210 --> 00:21:53,960  
hand-in-hand would you also agree to

455  
00:22:00,130 --> 00:21:58,220  
that assumption not necessarily because

456  
00:22:03,850 --> 00:22:00,140  
it depends on what the technologies are

457  
00:22:06,340 --> 00:22:03,860  
deployed to do nuclear weapons for

458  
00:22:08,890 --> 00:22:06,350  
example our technological tour de force

459  
00:22:10,270 --> 00:22:08,900  
but not a example of progress because

460  
00:22:12,880 --> 00:22:10,280  
they're designed to kill people who said

461  
00:22:16,180 --> 00:22:12,890  
they'd be better off antibiotics on the

462  
00:22:18,700 --> 00:22:16,190  
other hand oxidation panty retroviral

463  
00:22:21,580 --> 00:22:18,710

those are examples of progress because

464

00:22:24,190 --> 00:22:21,590

they also involve human ingenuity but in

465

00:22:26,620 --> 00:22:24,200

order to make people happier and

466

00:22:29,650 --> 00:22:26,630

healthier in longer lived so the

467

00:22:32,380 --> 00:22:29,660

progress technology only drives progress

468

00:22:34,780 --> 00:22:32,390

when it's deployed in the service of

469

00:22:37,030 --> 00:22:34,790

humanism and that's why crucially in my

470

00:22:38,640 --> 00:22:37,040

subtitle I had humanism

471

00:22:42,430 --> 00:22:38,650

as one of the ideals without it

472

00:22:44,670 --> 00:22:42,440

scientific advances don't necessarily

473

00:22:47,440 --> 00:22:44,680

lead to progress

474

00:22:49,660 --> 00:22:47,450

thank you we find with the russian

475

00:22:51,640 --> 00:22:49,670

philosopher Alexander Dugan he believes

476  
00:22:54,370 --> 00:22:51,650  
that these two should also not be

477  
00:22:56,020 --> 00:22:54,380  
equated that technological progress an

478  
00:22:59,350 --> 00:22:56,030  
ideological progress can be leagues

479  
00:23:01,960 --> 00:22:59,360  
apart when looking at the West do you

480  
00:23:03,730 --> 00:23:01,970  
find that this is the case or do you

481  
00:23:05,830 --> 00:23:03,740  
find that when you look at Western

482  
00:23:08,200 --> 00:23:05,840  
societies that their technological

483  
00:23:14,279 --> 00:23:08,210  
progress does match their ideological

484  
00:23:19,480 --> 00:23:16,029  
sorry about that I don't know if you're

485  
00:23:27,399 --> 00:23:19,490  
gonna do this so that's going online

486  
00:23:30,549 --> 00:23:27,409  
unedited okay so it'll be yeah sometimes

487  
00:23:33,760 --> 00:23:30,559  
not always and it's important to

488  
00:23:36,250 --> 00:23:33,770

distinguish enlightenment ideals with

489

00:23:38,590 --> 00:23:36,260

Western ideals of the Enlightenment a

490

00:23:40,630 --> 00:23:38,600

lot of the ideals originated in the West

491

00:23:42,730 --> 00:23:40,640

all ideas have to originate somewhere

492

00:23:45,310 --> 00:23:42,740

but they're they're not the same thing

493

00:23:47,789 --> 00:23:45,320

and in the West there's been furious

494

00:23:51,310 --> 00:23:47,799

opposition to enlightenment ideals I

495

00:23:54,909 --> 00:23:51,320

encounter enlightenment in romantic

496

00:23:57,250 --> 00:23:54,919

militarism in romantic nationalism so

497

00:23:59,440 --> 00:23:57,260

Western and enlightenment are definitely

498

00:24:04,799 --> 00:23:59,450

not the same thing and within the West

499

00:24:07,630 --> 00:24:04,809

there there have been many examples of

500

00:24:15,100 --> 00:24:07,640

progress often driven by by science and

501  
00:24:16,720 --> 00:24:15,110  
technology or by philosophy and human

502  
00:24:19,060 --> 00:24:16,730  
rights the Universal Declaration of

503  
00:24:21,700 --> 00:24:19,070  
Human Rights it's hard to even to call

504  
00:24:26,200 --> 00:24:21,710  
that Western it did most of it was

505  
00:24:29,430 --> 00:24:26,210  
written by by some Western thinkers and

506  
00:24:32,260 --> 00:24:29,440  
it was pushed by Eleanor Roosevelt but

507  
00:24:34,060 --> 00:24:32,270  
with the opposition of many forces

508  
00:24:34,899 --> 00:24:34,070  
within the West the United States is

509  
00:24:37,000 --> 00:24:34,909  
very squeamish

510  
00:24:38,880 --> 00:24:37,010  
for example her signing the Universal

511  
00:24:41,260 --> 00:24:38,890  
Declaration of Human Rights because

512  
00:24:42,000 --> 00:24:41,270  
there was Jim Crow those racial

513  
00:24:46,270 --> 00:24:42,010

segregation

514

00:24:47,500 --> 00:24:46,280

Britain was uneasy about the Universal

515

00:24:49,630 --> 00:24:47,510

Declaration of Human Rights but they

516

00:24:54,730 --> 00:24:49,640

still had their colonies where as a

517

00:24:58,690 --> 00:24:54,740

number of Eastern countries were happy

518

00:25:01,960 --> 00:24:58,700

to sign on Ethiopia and Africa a number

519

00:25:05,200 --> 00:25:01,970

of Muslim majority countries were happy

520

00:25:08,860 --> 00:25:05,210

to so later on so is universal human

521

00:25:12,710 --> 00:25:08,870

rights a Western concept well somewhat

522

00:25:14,330 --> 00:25:12,720

and somewhat not understand

523

00:25:15,950 --> 00:25:14,340

that it varies and the way it's

524

00:25:17,900 --> 00:25:15,960

benefiting like an ideas have been

525

00:25:19,460 --> 00:25:17,910

adopted would you still say that the

526

00:25:26,030 --> 00:25:19,470

genesis of the Enlightenment is a

527

00:25:30,500 --> 00:25:26,040

uniquely European phenomenon no some of

528

00:25:33,970 --> 00:25:30,510

the parallel ideas originated in other

529

00:25:40,190 --> 00:25:33,980

parts of the world in in India in

530

00:25:45,820 --> 00:25:40,200

Ethiopia there was a hermit living in a

531

00:25:49,790 --> 00:25:45,830

cave in Ethiopia named Yakov who

532

00:25:51,860 --> 00:25:49,800

originally sorry independently came up

533

00:25:57,080 --> 00:25:51,870

with a number of the like things like

534

00:26:01,370 --> 00:25:57,090

skepticism of a scripture and human

535

00:26:03,530 --> 00:26:01,380

rights more recently in the family of

536

00:26:06,740 --> 00:26:03,540

ideas that I think most of us would want

537

00:26:09,400 --> 00:26:06,750

to promote their ideas that distinctly

538

00:26:12,530 --> 00:26:09,410

came from the East such as Gandhi's

539

00:26:14,660 --> 00:26:12,540

concept of nonviolent resistance such as

540

00:26:18,790 --> 00:26:14,670

restorative justice and Ubuntu from

541

00:26:23,570 --> 00:26:18,800

South Africa so the family of ideas that

542

00:26:25,610 --> 00:26:23,580

center around using knowledge to advance

543

00:26:30,170 --> 00:26:25,620

human well-being they can come from

544

00:26:32,300 --> 00:26:30,180

anywhere if we dilute the Enlightenment

545

00:26:34,700 --> 00:26:32,310

down to just sort of these Universal

546

00:26:38,330 --> 00:26:34,710

ideas as opposed to a specific European

547

00:26:41,330 --> 00:26:38,340

movement do we run the risk of sort of

548

00:26:43,490 --> 00:26:41,340

decaffeinated it into just the kind of

549

00:26:47,300 --> 00:26:43,500

core essence of human beings that seeks

550

00:26:51,350 --> 00:26:47,310

freedom oh it's still the Enlightenment

551  
00:26:54,170 --> 00:26:51,360  
well yes and no so no in terms of

552  
00:26:55,910 --> 00:26:54,180  
capital e enlightenment if find that you

553  
00:26:57,800 --> 00:26:55,920  
want to use the word to refer to these

554  
00:26:59,360 --> 00:26:57,810  
family of ideas that originated in

555  
00:27:03,500 --> 00:26:59,370  
certain fingers the second half of the

556  
00:27:05,570 --> 00:27:03,510  
18th century but words often often have

557  
00:27:07,490 --> 00:27:05,580  
multiple meanings there are far fewer

558  
00:27:10,190 --> 00:27:07,500  
words in the English language than there

559  
00:27:11,810 --> 00:27:10,200  
are concepts and so we can distinguish

560  
00:27:14,780 --> 00:27:11,820  
the Enlightenment referring to a

561  
00:27:17,600 --> 00:27:14,790  
historical period and movement from

562  
00:27:20,780 --> 00:27:17,610  
enlightenment ideals namely reason

563  
00:27:23,030 --> 00:27:20,790

science and humanism and as long as

564

00:27:25,510 --> 00:27:23,040

we'll clear which the work we're

565

00:27:28,370 --> 00:27:25,520

referring to on the news Gordon light

566

00:27:30,440 --> 00:27:28,380

would you attribute the polygenesis of

567

00:27:32,090 --> 00:27:30,450

these Enlightenment ideas as a

568

00:27:34,550 --> 00:27:32,100

reflection of our human nature that

569

00:27:37,610 --> 00:27:34,560

human beings want freedom seek

570

00:27:41,630 --> 00:27:37,620

rationality universally and this is why

571

00:27:44,540 --> 00:27:41,640

it's polygenesis some extent they think

572

00:27:46,850 --> 00:27:44,550

is that we all want freedom for

573

00:27:50,000 --> 00:27:46,860

ourselves the idea that we ought to

574

00:27:53,810 --> 00:27:50,010

promote freedom for everyone may not be

575

00:27:56,030 --> 00:27:53,820

so hardwired into human nature but it

576

00:27:58,960 --> 00:27:56,040

might be universal nonetheless with a

577

00:28:01,640 --> 00:27:58,970

combination of features of human

578

00:28:04,370 --> 00:28:01,650

rationality and self-interest just the

579

00:28:06,800 --> 00:28:04,380

logical necessity that you can't

580

00:28:08,570 --> 00:28:06,810

coherence waiting saying but only my

581

00:28:11,480 --> 00:28:08,580

rights count because I mean you're not

582

00:28:14,060 --> 00:28:11,490

well project doesn't recognize me but

583

00:28:19,700 --> 00:28:14,070

versus you and so when you have certain

584

00:28:22,160 --> 00:28:19,710

human intuitions such as our own desire

585

00:28:25,520 --> 00:28:22,170

for health and happiness for ourselves

586

00:28:27,860 --> 00:28:25,530

and our families but then sharpened in

587

00:28:30,830 --> 00:28:27,870

the core or hardened in the crucible of

588

00:28:34,520 --> 00:28:30,840

debate in discussion with people who are

589

00:28:37,160 --> 00:28:34,530

unlike us then the requirement of

590

00:28:39,770 --> 00:28:37,170

logical consistency paired with the

591

00:28:43,060 --> 00:28:39,780

desire for freedom and well-being will

592

00:28:45,320 --> 00:28:43,070

push in the direction of universal I can

593

00:28:48,470 --> 00:28:45,330

namely soon as I'm in conversation with

594

00:28:50,000 --> 00:28:48,480

you I can't say well only my happiness

595

00:28:51,950 --> 00:28:50,010

counts because I mean you're not and

596

00:28:53,900 --> 00:28:51,960

hope for you to continue the

597

00:28:55,640 --> 00:28:53,910

conversation if we're gonna come to any

598

00:28:57,710 --> 00:28:55,650

kind of agreement it's gonna have to be

599

00:29:00,560 --> 00:28:57,720

well if I value my freedom I've got to

600

00:29:02,390 --> 00:29:00,570

acknowledge your desire for your freedom

601  
00:29:05,120 --> 00:29:02,400  
so let's come up with a social

602  
00:29:07,250 --> 00:29:05,130  
arrangement that gives us the maximum

603  
00:29:09,680 --> 00:29:07,260  
amount of freedom consistent with our

604  
00:29:11,450 --> 00:29:09,690  
not impinge upon each other's freedom we

605  
00:29:13,850 --> 00:29:11,460  
come up with a social contract there's

606  
00:29:15,590 --> 00:29:13,860  
not exactly human nature that a single

607  
00:29:17,870 --> 00:29:15,600  
person thinking up how the world would

608  
00:29:19,880 --> 00:29:17,880  
work would never come up with that or

609  
00:29:22,340 --> 00:29:19,890  
probably wouldn't but with human nature

610  
00:29:24,550 --> 00:29:22,350  
in the combination of discourse debate

611  
00:29:27,080 --> 00:29:24,560  
holding other people to account

612  
00:29:30,140 --> 00:29:27,090  
ferreting out law school inconsistencies

613  
00:29:32,570 --> 00:29:30,150

can I think will push in the direction

614

00:29:34,490 --> 00:29:32,580

of humanism than other Enlightenment

615

00:29:37,970 --> 00:29:34,500

values

616

00:29:40,220 --> 00:29:37,980

if if these sort of intuitions that are

617

00:29:44,630 --> 00:29:40,230

that are required for this crucible of

618

00:29:46,190 --> 00:29:44,640

debate discussion are universal and are

619

00:29:48,740 --> 00:29:46,200

something that human beings didn't

620

00:29:52,039 --> 00:29:48,750

choose to have they sort of transcend

621

00:29:53,480 --> 00:29:52,049

our conscious choice and are ascribed

622

00:29:55,580 --> 00:29:53,490

into our natures is it something that's

623

00:29:58,570 --> 00:29:55,590

therefore beyond humanism in the sense

624

00:30:00,710 --> 00:29:58,580

that human beings control being the

625

00:30:03,289 --> 00:30:00,720

instincts that cause them to be

626  
00:30:06,080 --> 00:30:03,299  
enlightened they are because if maybe

627  
00:30:08,840 --> 00:30:06,090  
evolution larger historical factors and

628  
00:30:16,130 --> 00:30:08,850  
that we just kind of play along in this

629  
00:30:18,560 --> 00:30:16,140  
role I think they're they're natural in

630  
00:30:21,340 --> 00:30:18,570  
the sense that as people start to

631  
00:30:23,240 --> 00:30:21,350  
interact with larger and larger

632  
00:30:25,840 --> 00:30:23,250  
universes of discourse

633  
00:30:30,590 --> 00:30:25,850  
more people who are unlike themselves

634  
00:30:32,720 --> 00:30:30,600  
and and as they learn from historical

635  
00:30:35,779 --> 00:30:32,730  
mistakes as they see what works and what

636  
00:30:37,340 --> 00:30:35,789  
doesn't anybody of course it pushes them

637  
00:30:39,020 --> 00:30:37,350  
in the direction of universal a few

638  
00:30:41,990 --> 00:30:39,030

minutes but if although it's far from

639

00:30:44,960 --> 00:30:42,000

determined because ideals and norms and

640

00:30:48,620 --> 00:30:44,970

institutions like checks and balances

641

00:30:51,649 --> 00:30:48,630

liberal democracy peer-review scientific

642

00:30:53,060 --> 00:30:51,659

communities free speech those are not an

643

00:30:55,850 --> 00:30:53,070

inevitable they're not even particularly

644

00:30:58,490 --> 00:30:55,860

natural they are optimal in the sense

645

00:31:00,830 --> 00:30:58,500

that if we seek to improve our condition

646

00:31:01,610 --> 00:31:00,840

those are the mechanisms that will allow

647

00:31:03,380 --> 00:31:01,620

us to do it

648

00:31:06,909 --> 00:31:03,390

and I think it's for that reason that

649

00:31:10,340 --> 00:31:06,919

you do see some you do see progress

650

00:31:12,560 --> 00:31:10,350

materially there is it seems to be a

651  
00:31:16,370 --> 00:31:12,570  
historical movement toward abolishing

652  
00:31:19,760 --> 00:31:16,380  
slavery even sacrifice discriminatory

653  
00:31:23,710 --> 00:31:19,770  
laws and practices and cruel practices

654  
00:31:26,810 --> 00:31:23,720  
not even not inevitable not monotonic

655  
00:31:29,840 --> 00:31:26,820  
but unmistakable and I think it's the

656  
00:31:34,159 --> 00:31:29,850  
combination of me of human interests and

657  
00:31:38,380 --> 00:31:34,169  
the inherent impartiality or objectivity

658  
00:31:41,149 --> 00:31:38,390  
of a reason women where did you apply it

659  
00:31:44,270 --> 00:31:41,159  
if as soon as you get commit to reason

660  
00:31:48,120 --> 00:31:44,280  
you're forced along certain tracks

661  
00:31:50,910 --> 00:31:48,130  
if the let's say this is a sort of game

662  
00:31:53,850 --> 00:31:50,920  
theory scenario right where like you

663  
00:31:55,890 --> 00:31:53,860

said my recognizing if your rights and

664

00:31:58,370 --> 00:31:55,900

your recognizing my rights lead to an

665

00:32:02,940 --> 00:31:58,380

optimal sort of super ordinance

666

00:32:05,250 --> 00:32:02,950

situation arthel are the rules that make

667

00:32:07,880 --> 00:32:05,260

that super ordinate situation are

668

00:32:10,500 --> 00:32:07,890

optimal game we should be playing

669

00:32:12,750 --> 00:32:10,510

determined by human beings or are human

670

00:32:13,290 --> 00:32:12,760

beings players in the game where the

671

00:32:17,850 --> 00:32:13,300

rules

672

00:32:19,800 --> 00:32:17,860

are beyond us

673

00:32:21,050 --> 00:32:19,810

is it still fair to say that human

674

00:32:23,820 --> 00:32:21,060

beings are the greatest

675

00:32:27,240 --> 00:32:23,830

determiners of their of their destiny

676

00:32:32,010 --> 00:32:27,250

that there's still humanism or at least

677

00:32:34,020 --> 00:32:32,020

for these rules transhuman yeah yeah I

678

00:32:36,540 --> 00:32:34,030

tend to think there are trans human is

679

00:32:40,170 --> 00:32:36,550

that any rational rational

680

00:32:43,940 --> 00:32:40,180

self-interested species would be forced

681

00:32:48,090 --> 00:32:43,950

to them in the inner limit as discourse

682

00:32:51,660 --> 00:32:48,100

proceeds over time they are thought up

683

00:32:54,630 --> 00:32:51,670

by humans they in constraint unit so for

684

00:32:57,360 --> 00:32:54,640

example I love the idea of peer review

685

00:32:59,370 --> 00:32:57,370

in science and I hate the experience of

686

00:33:01,740 --> 00:32:59,380

getting reviews of my own manuscripts

687

00:33:05,580 --> 00:33:01,750

back because like all scientists I think

688

00:33:08,280 --> 00:33:05,590

idiots would miss the point why do you

689

00:33:10,530 --> 00:33:08,290

want me to mess up my beautiful paper on

690

00:33:13,290 --> 00:33:10,540

the other hand stepping back I realize

691

00:33:17,250 --> 00:33:13,300

as much as I hate the reviews that I get

692

00:33:20,780 --> 00:33:17,260

at a meta level I sign on to the whole

693

00:33:22,950 --> 00:33:20,790

idea of peer review knowing and

694

00:33:24,570 --> 00:33:22,960

simultaneously that I'm right about

695

00:33:26,130 --> 00:33:24,580

everything that I say and that as a

696

00:33:27,930 --> 00:33:26,140

human being if it couldn't possibly be

697

00:33:30,980 --> 00:33:27,940

right about everything that I say so we

698

00:33:33,750 --> 00:33:30,990

do have to live with that dual conscious

699

00:33:37,080 --> 00:33:33,760

consciousness as the combination

700

00:33:39,000 --> 00:33:37,090

probably of our evolutionarily fake

701  
00:33:41,160 --> 00:33:39,010  
human nature which is to believe that

702  
00:33:43,010 --> 00:33:41,170  
we're always right and Noble and the

703  
00:33:44,970 --> 00:33:43,020  
conclusion that were forced to in

704  
00:33:47,670 --> 00:33:44,980  
discussion with others in

705  
00:33:49,770 --> 00:33:47,680  
acknowledgement of history that yeah

706  
00:33:54,530 --> 00:33:49,780  
everyone thinks they're right it can't

707  
00:33:58,890 --> 00:33:54,540  
all be right they are wrong I'm not a

708  
00:34:02,160 --> 00:33:58,900  
Superman I'm not a deity I can't be any

709  
00:34:04,410 --> 00:34:02,170  
less fallible that everyone else that I

710  
00:34:07,410 --> 00:34:04,420  
see therefore I'm going to submit to

711  
00:34:11,550 --> 00:34:07,420  
those rules so don't come naturally but

712  
00:34:14,280 --> 00:34:11,560  
in something that we can fall into given

713  
00:34:16,620 --> 00:34:14,290

debate given experience given awareness

714

00:34:21,040 --> 00:34:16,630

of history

715

00:34:24,010 --> 00:34:21,050

which is essentially claiming that

716

00:34:24,550 --> 00:34:24,020

liberalism is the undisputed champion of

717

00:34:26,470 --> 00:34:24,560

the world

718

00:34:28,600 --> 00:34:26,480

but then there's Alexander Alexander

719

00:34:31,180 --> 00:34:28,610

Dugan who says no there's a multiplicity

720

00:34:33,130 --> 00:34:31,190

of other options viable options do you

721

00:34:37,770 --> 00:34:33,140

see there being another option to

722

00:34:42,970 --> 00:34:40,870

there's no viable alternative to reason

723

00:34:44,470 --> 00:34:42,980

certainly if as soon as you start to

724

00:34:45,760 --> 00:34:44,480

argue that there might be we've lost the

725

00:34:48,070 --> 00:34:45,770

argument because you've appealed to

726

00:34:49,990 --> 00:34:48,080

reason or if you conversely if you

727

00:34:51,280 --> 00:34:50,000

reject reason there's no reason for

728

00:34:53,620 --> 00:34:51,290

anyone to take the argument seriously

729

00:34:55,030 --> 00:34:53,630

because you confess there's no good

730

00:34:57,370 --> 00:34:55,040

reason to believe it so I don't think

731

00:34:58,630 --> 00:34:57,380

there's an alternative to reason I don't

732

00:35:01,240 --> 00:34:58,640

think it's an alternative to humanism

733

00:35:03,070 --> 00:35:01,250

other than that you could argue for I

734

00:35:08,860 --> 00:35:03,080

mean you could impose it by brute force

735

00:35:12,550 --> 00:35:08,870

and again you're not about argument then

736

00:35:13,510 --> 00:35:12,560

it is I have a little justifiable for

737

00:35:16,120 --> 00:35:13,520

the same reason I don't think there's an

738

00:35:18,130 --> 00:35:16,130

alternative to science now this isn't is

739

00:35:20,410 --> 00:35:18,140

these our normative arguments is what we

740

00:35:22,570 --> 00:35:20,420

ought to strive for if you interpret

741

00:35:25,180 --> 00:35:22,580

Fukuyama's making historical argument

742

00:35:27,340 --> 00:35:25,190

that societies will inevitably go in

743

00:35:29,050 --> 00:35:27,350

that direction it's not clear that he

744

00:35:30,910 --> 00:35:29,060

himself would have argued that but that

745

00:35:33,970 --> 00:35:30,920

certainly isn't true he could certainly

746

00:35:37,080 --> 00:35:33,980

have our society's evolving into a

747

00:35:39,130 --> 00:35:37,090

dictatorship and other forms of

748

00:35:41,440 --> 00:35:39,140

authoritarianism in terms of the

749

00:35:43,870 --> 00:35:41,450

direction that the world has taken I

750

00:35:46,600 --> 00:35:43,880

think it's easy to blow off Fukuyama and

751

00:35:49,060 --> 00:35:46,610

he did set himself up for easy

752

00:35:51,130 --> 00:35:49,070

refutation honking articles that

753

00:35:53,380 --> 00:35:51,140

announced the return of history with the

754

00:35:58,110 --> 00:35:53,390

rise of authoritarian capitalism in

755

00:36:01,480 --> 00:35:58,120

China or nationalist populism in Russia

756

00:36:04,630 --> 00:36:01,490

in the United States on the other hand

757

00:36:07,290 --> 00:36:04,640

in Fukuyama's defense the number of

758

00:36:10,510 --> 00:36:07,300

democracies has increased since he

759

00:36:14,590 --> 00:36:10,520

published that article in 1989 and not

760

00:36:19,450 --> 00:36:14,600

just in the Eastern Europe but in Latin

761

00:36:23,740 --> 00:36:19,460

America in East Asia in Africa and even

762

00:36:25,880 --> 00:36:23,750

with the a clashes it's not clear

763

00:36:28,730 --> 00:36:25,890

in the future how many countries are

764

00:36:32,900 --> 00:36:28,740

gonna model one sells on there's a good

765

00:36:34,400 --> 00:36:32,910

news Russia it seems unlikely so end of

766

00:36:37,490 --> 00:36:34,410

history is a gimmick a minute even

767

00:36:39,230 --> 00:36:37,500

Fukuyama probably didn't really the end

768

00:36:42,470 --> 00:36:39,240

he certainly didn't be history in terms

769

00:36:46,310 --> 00:36:42,480

of stuff no longer happening I mean it

770

00:36:49,970 --> 00:36:46,320

conflict over major systems of national

771

00:36:52,490 --> 00:36:49,980

organization but it's in terms of

772

00:36:54,980 --> 00:36:52,500

whether say France is going to become

773

00:36:56,210 --> 00:36:54,990

more like China in 50 years or China is

774

00:37:00,890 --> 00:36:56,220

going to become more like more like

775

00:37:02,450 --> 00:37:00,900

France it's it's not if I had to bet on

776

00:37:03,410 --> 00:37:02,460

one or the other I'd say try to become

777

00:37:05,960 --> 00:37:03,420

more like France

778

00:37:08,090 --> 00:37:05,970

okay speaking on this is odd divide have

779

00:37:09,520 --> 00:37:08,100

you read Sam Harris as moral landscape

780

00:37:13,120 --> 00:37:09,530

and if so what do you think about it

781

00:37:17,920 --> 00:37:13,130

yeah I am I came to be sympathetic with

782

00:37:21,860 --> 00:37:17,930

with Harris learned in moral landscape I

783

00:37:25,490 --> 00:37:21,870

it is a statement of humanism he made in

784

00:37:29,480 --> 00:37:25,500

some aspects of it more strongly I would

785

00:37:33,470 --> 00:37:29,490

he claims that in a nutshell told was

786

00:37:35,270 --> 00:37:33,480

simplified it that what is moral is a an

787

00:37:39,860 --> 00:37:35,280

empirical matter matter of what makes

788

00:37:41,510 --> 00:37:39,870

people best off and if you interpret

789

00:37:43,160 --> 00:37:41,520

that as saying that it is just an

790

00:37:46,730 --> 00:37:43,170

empirical matter that there is no

791

00:37:48,200 --> 00:37:46,740

philosophical ground into it then I

792

00:37:50,270 --> 00:37:48,210

think that would go too far it's not

793

00:37:52,920 --> 00:37:50,280

clear whether Sam himself would insist

794

00:37:57,839 --> 00:37:56,480

it's a view of progress compatible with

795

00:38:03,819 --> 00:37:57,849

post-modernism

796

00:38:06,230 --> 00:38:03,829

a sort of anti grand narrative ideology

797

00:38:15,300 --> 00:38:06,240

depends on what aspect of post-modernism

798

00:38:15,310 --> 00:38:22,370

you

799

00:38:27,620 --> 00:38:25,040

there may be within most models the idea

800

00:38:31,670 --> 00:38:27,630

that when power imbalances get rectified

801  
00:38:34,250 --> 00:38:31,680  
when people of color and women wrest

802  
00:38:38,990 --> 00:38:34,260  
power from white males that would be a

803  
00:38:41,600 --> 00:38:39,000  
kind of progress but certainly the

804  
00:38:43,550 --> 00:38:41,610  
notion that there's been a long history

805  
00:38:46,490 --> 00:38:43,560  
of progress which could continue driven

806  
00:38:48,380 --> 00:38:46,500  
by science and universal human rights I

807  
00:38:50,060 --> 00:38:48,390  
think probably most public post

808  
00:38:52,040 --> 00:38:50,070  
modernists women said wouldn't sign on

809  
00:38:53,810 --> 00:38:52,050  
to that yeah I'm not sure I would call

810  
00:38:57,160 --> 00:38:53,820  
that a grand narrative you know if

811  
00:38:59,710 --> 00:38:57,170  
people if people try to solve problems

812  
00:39:03,680 --> 00:38:59,720  
occasionally they succeed if they

813  
00:39:05,660 --> 00:39:03,690

solutions cumulate and then now life can

814

00:39:07,280 --> 00:39:05,670

get better for more and more people is

815

00:39:08,990 --> 00:39:07,290

that a grand narrative it doesn't sound

816

00:39:11,570 --> 00:39:09,000

so grand to me but it is something that

817

00:39:13,910 --> 00:39:11,580

I would defend okay while we're

818

00:39:16,100 --> 00:39:13,920

irritating the post modernists there's

819

00:39:17,600 --> 00:39:16,110

progressive nations then that means that

820

00:39:19,760 --> 00:39:17,610

there's non progressive nations or even

821

00:39:21,230 --> 00:39:19,770

perhaps backwards nations does this mean

822

00:39:26,360 --> 00:39:21,240

that some cultures are better than

823

00:39:28,790 --> 00:39:26,370

others well better than others in some

824

00:39:30,920 --> 00:39:28,800

ways so I think for example a culture

825

00:39:33,050 --> 00:39:30,930

which wouldn't have equality is better

826

00:39:34,700 --> 00:39:33,060

in that regard in which the girls are

827

00:39:38,090 --> 00:39:34,710

kicked out of school and women are

828

00:39:40,970 --> 00:39:38,100

forced to marry and prevented from

829

00:39:43,460 --> 00:39:40,980

driving and coding so yeah I think it's

830

00:39:46,640 --> 00:39:43,470

a society that executes homosexual

831

00:39:52,390 --> 00:39:46,650

sexuals is morally inferior to one that

832

00:39:54,890 --> 00:39:52,400

has equal rights so yeah I think if you

833

00:39:57,430 --> 00:39:54,900

it sounds more radical than it is but if

834

00:39:59,660 --> 00:39:57,440

you have any world standards whatsoever

835

00:40:01,670 --> 00:39:59,670

societies differ in the degree to which

836

00:40:04,460 --> 00:40:01,680

they implement and enlist in those

837

00:40:07,160 --> 00:40:04,470

regards those practices of those

838

00:40:08,510 --> 00:40:07,170

societies are our superior doesn't mean

839

00:40:11,270 --> 00:40:08,520

that the people are superior doesn't

840

00:40:13,160 --> 00:40:11,280

mean that that any individual has more

841

00:40:15,140 --> 00:40:13,170

inherent moral value than any other one

842

00:40:18,200 --> 00:40:15,150

but in terms of cultures practices

843

00:40:21,310 --> 00:40:18,210

habits yeah how could you maintain the

844

00:40:23,450 --> 00:40:21,320

oxygen any commitments to raise morale

845

00:40:24,980 --> 00:40:23,460

okay I know you gotta go so Peters gonna

846

00:40:29,330 --> 00:40:24,990

ask one question then if I have time

847

00:40:31,070 --> 00:40:29,340

I'll just ask one more okay what is the

848

00:40:34,460 --> 00:40:31,080

cause of this progress that you've

849

00:40:35,200 --> 00:40:34,470

observed in your writings at what

850

00:40:37,270 --> 00:40:35,210

expense

851

00:40:39,880 --> 00:40:37,280

we obtained it when one looks at the

852

00:40:42,670 --> 00:40:39,890

history it's tempting to say that

853

00:40:45,339 --> 00:40:42,680

because of colonialism slavery child

854

00:40:47,770 --> 00:40:45,349

labor in factories that this was sort of

855

00:40:50,349 --> 00:40:47,780

the price cream enlightened societies

856

00:40:54,270 --> 00:40:50,359

paid for their advancement what would

857

00:40:57,670 --> 00:40:54,280

you say to that claim found labor is

858

00:40:59,380 --> 00:40:57,680

certainly astley predates the

859

00:41:01,300 --> 00:40:59,390

Enlightenment that was just the default

860

00:41:04,839 --> 00:41:01,310

you set your children to work in the

861

00:41:07,240 --> 00:41:04,849

farm on the farm I made very briefly to

862

00:41:09,310 --> 00:41:07,250

specify when we mentioned child labor

863

00:41:11,650 --> 00:41:09,320

specifically in the English textile

864

00:41:14,490 --> 00:41:11,660

industry from which the industrial

865

00:41:17,400 --> 00:41:14,500

revolutions are those let's say sparked

866

00:41:19,990 --> 00:41:17,410

there was a recruitment for orphans

867

00:41:22,060 --> 00:41:20,000

small children with nimble fingers that

868

00:41:24,250 --> 00:41:22,070

could work threading machines these are

869

00:41:28,960 --> 00:41:24,260

the specific child laborers referring to

870

00:41:33,160 --> 00:41:28,970

yeah yeah there were well there were a

871

00:41:35,500 --> 00:41:33,170

clearly a number of harms that coincide

872

00:41:37,660 --> 00:41:35,510

it with say with the Industrial

873

00:41:39,880 --> 00:41:37,670

Revolution and if we could go back in

874

00:41:42,220 --> 00:41:39,890

time and make arguments then that we

875

00:41:44,290 --> 00:41:42,230

appreciate now then one can imagine

876

00:41:46,450 --> 00:41:44,300

alternative history that would have had

877

00:41:49,960 --> 00:41:46,460

the advantages of industrialization

878

00:41:53,380 --> 00:41:49,970

without the video harms certainly

879

00:41:57,220 --> 00:41:53,390

colonial exploitation we entity had

880

00:41:59,829 --> 00:41:57,230

educated with beginning with conversant

881

00:42:03,700 --> 00:41:59,839

Cortez and Bizzaro that was way before

882

00:42:06,250 --> 00:42:03,710

the Enlightenment in fact it's kind of

883

00:42:08,380 --> 00:42:06,260

what empires did throughout history as

884

00:42:10,510 --> 00:42:08,390

they conquered and Exploited this their

885

00:42:13,410 --> 00:42:10,520

subjugated crow population so I would

886

00:42:17,920 --> 00:42:13,420

not say that those are certainly a

887

00:42:22,920 --> 00:42:17,930

necessary accompaniment of enlightenment

888

00:42:28,599 --> 00:42:22,930

values but more generally nothing is

889

00:42:31,240 --> 00:42:28,609

occurs with only benefits especially in

890

00:42:33,700 --> 00:42:31,250

hindsight there's a lot that are to have

891

00:42:37,240 --> 00:42:33,710

unfolded differently in terms of the

892

00:42:41,109 --> 00:42:37,250

necessary price that was paid certainly

893

00:42:43,120 --> 00:42:41,119

firm to the environment was an

894

00:42:45,790 --> 00:42:43,130

accompaniment in industrialization that

895

00:42:48,470 --> 00:42:45,800

we still have not dealt with in the case

896

00:42:51,320 --> 00:42:48,480

of greenhouse gas emissions

897

00:42:52,970 --> 00:42:51,330

the next stage anything we didn't want

898

00:42:55,660 --> 00:42:52,980

to call progress is to enjoy the

899

00:42:58,310 --> 00:42:55,670

advances that energy capture has brought

900

00:43:00,620 --> 00:42:58,320

while rectifying and undoing the harm

901  
00:43:02,950 --> 00:43:00,630  
that we've done to the planet if I may

902  
00:43:04,820 --> 00:43:02,960  
just press on your answer to a degree

903  
00:43:07,280 --> 00:43:04,830  
understanding that these let's say

904  
00:43:09,620 --> 00:43:07,290  
perils and evils predate the

905  
00:43:11,840 --> 00:43:09,630  
Enlightenment is it still possible that

906  
00:43:14,780 --> 00:43:11,850  
they were a huge contributing factor for

907  
00:43:17,300 --> 00:43:14,790  
the success of enlightened societies who

908  
00:43:22,610 --> 00:43:17,310  
made let's say the most efficient use of

909  
00:43:26,000 --> 00:43:22,620  
these perils did to some extent so for

910  
00:43:31,070 --> 00:43:26,010  
example the growth in economies in the

911  
00:43:33,100 --> 00:43:31,080  
19th century or especially the first

912  
00:43:35,990 --> 00:43:33,110  
half of the 19th century are we

913  
00:43:38,120 --> 00:43:36,000

exploited slave labor particularly in

914

00:43:39,680 --> 00:43:38,130

the United States although of course it

915

00:43:41,860 --> 00:43:39,690

was the 19th century in which slavery

916

00:43:45,260 --> 00:43:41,870

was for the first time in history

917

00:43:48,020 --> 00:43:45,270

abolished in country after country but

918

00:43:52,790 --> 00:43:48,030

yes it is a more general answer is that

919

00:43:56,510 --> 00:43:52,800

as history unfolded there were harms

920

00:43:59,120 --> 00:43:56,520

that accompanied the benefits were they

921

00:44:00,980 --> 00:43:59,130

necessary I don't think so but since

922

00:44:02,000 --> 00:44:00,990

history only unfolded once we'll never

923

00:44:03,770 --> 00:44:02,010

know for sure

924

00:44:09,470 --> 00:44:03,780

that is if enlightenment were applied

925

00:44:13,910 --> 00:44:09,480

more consistently and the rights and

926  
00:44:16,280 --> 00:44:13,920  
interests of people in populations

927  
00:44:18,620 --> 00:44:16,290  
populations in Africa and Asia were

928  
00:44:20,390 --> 00:44:18,630  
taken into account if the universal

929  
00:44:23,120 --> 00:44:20,400  
human rights movie was Universal

930  
00:44:24,890 --> 00:44:23,130  
couldn't have had an industrial

931  
00:44:28,370 --> 00:44:24,900  
revolution and expansion of rights that

932  
00:44:31,010 --> 00:44:28,380  
truly was universal I think that that

933  
00:44:32,840 --> 00:44:31,020  
could have happened it didn't happen the

934  
00:44:34,670 --> 00:44:32,850  
extent that they should have the

935  
00:44:36,470 --> 00:44:34,680  
universal human rights have to wait at

936  
00:44:39,140 --> 00:44:36,480  
least a century maybe hundred fifty

937  
00:44:41,840 --> 00:44:39,150  
years and that is going to history of

938  
00:44:44,210 --> 00:44:41,850

Kovach yes okay the last question you

939

00:44:45,620 --> 00:44:44,220

can choose between one of these two do

940

00:44:47,870 --> 00:44:45,630

you feel like some of the new atheist

941

00:44:49,190 --> 00:44:47,880

feel that Jordan Peterson is causing

942

00:44:50,990 --> 00:44:49,200

harm to the Enlightenment project by

943

00:44:52,010 --> 00:44:51,000

making religion more palatable so that's

944

00:44:54,770 --> 00:44:52,020

question number one you can choose that

945

00:44:56,390 --> 00:44:54,780

or what are your thoughts on Noam

946

00:44:58,220 --> 00:44:56,400

Chomsky I know he has some disagreements

947

00:45:00,500 --> 00:44:58,230

with you and I wanted to know if if

948

00:45:01,670 --> 00:45:00,510

you've read them and if you could

949

00:45:02,360 --> 00:45:01,680

outline to our audience what they are

950

00:45:04,190 --> 00:45:02,370

and then yours

951  
00:45:08,720 --> 00:45:04,200  
sponsors to that you can choose those

952  
00:45:11,510 --> 00:45:08,730  
two Oh Jordan Peterson is a poly by his

953  
00:45:14,990 --> 00:45:11,520  
own mission many ways to count for

954  
00:45:16,970 --> 00:45:15,000  
enlightenment think so including his

955  
00:45:24,590 --> 00:45:16,980  
sympathy to religion his skepticism

956  
00:45:27,320 --> 00:45:24,600  
about progress so yes I don't I don't

957  
00:45:29,840 --> 00:45:27,330  
think I would identify him despite his

958  
00:45:32,360 --> 00:45:29,850  
intellectual independence he was willing

959  
00:45:34,820 --> 00:45:32,370  
mr. challenged Authority he is not what

960  
00:45:42,100 --> 00:45:34,830  
you would call a defender of the project

961  
00:45:45,920 --> 00:45:42,110  
in terms of Chomsky he I think he has a

962  
00:45:48,770 --> 00:45:45,930  
being an anarchist himself necessary not

963  
00:45:51,140 --> 00:45:48,780

only has a romantic vision of life in

964

00:45:54,670 --> 00:45:51,150

the state of nature about before the

965

00:45:59,090 --> 00:45:54,680

onset of government and civilization the

966

00:46:01,250 --> 00:45:59,100

data pretty much universally show that

967

00:46:03,260 --> 00:46:01,260

there were higher rates of violence in

968

00:46:06,020 --> 00:46:03,270

pre state societies than in state

969

00:46:09,890 --> 00:46:06,030

societies this would include the biggest

970

00:46:12,500 --> 00:46:09,900

analysis does are after I finish better

971

00:46:14,840 --> 00:46:12,510

angels of our nature by a Hosea Jose

972

00:46:19,430 --> 00:46:14,850

Maria Gomez and his collaborators where

973

00:46:21,650 --> 00:46:19,440

they accumulated every datum that they

974

00:46:25,490 --> 00:46:21,660

could come across on race of violence in

975

00:46:27,350 --> 00:46:25,500

ants tribes chiefdoms and States and in

976  
00:46:29,570 --> 00:46:27,360  
of course there are hundreds of society

977  
00:46:31,970 --> 00:46:29,580  
they show unequivocally that rates of

978  
00:46:34,670 --> 00:46:31,980  
violence are lower in state societies

979  
00:46:40,550 --> 00:46:34,680  
than in tribal societies so I can think

980  
00:46:44,600 --> 00:46:40,560  
that although no tends to deny that it

981  
00:46:46,970 --> 00:46:44,610  
goes against his gift i sensibilities

982  
00:46:49,400 --> 00:46:46,980  
but that's that's what we do suggest if

983  
00:46:52,280 --> 00:46:49,410  
you look at their entire instead of

984  
00:46:54,950 --> 00:46:52,290  
cherry picking a few peaceful societies

985  
00:46:57,020 --> 00:46:54,960  
was an ugly list and and and I am

986  
00:46:59,210 --> 00:46:57,030  
celebrating the fact that societies have

987  
00:47:02,090 --> 00:46:59,220  
become more peaceful over time but they

988  
00:47:04,520 --> 00:47:02,100

did not start out peaceful thank you so

989

00:47:06,230 --> 00:47:04,530

much time I appreciate it I was a

990

00:47:08,630 --> 00:47:06,240

pleasure thank you so much for your time

991

00:47:10,400 --> 00:47:08,640

and you and sorry for the interruptions

992

00:47:19,780 --> 00:47:10,410

thanks thank you very much have a great

993

00:47:32,950 --> 00:47:26,050

yes can you hear me thank you

994

00:47:36,400 --> 00:47:32,960

where are you by the way congratulations

995

00:47:41,470 --> 00:47:36,410

thank you what but the next question is

996

00:47:43,569 --> 00:47:41,480

wearing taupe but what recall okay I'm

997

00:47:51,430 --> 00:47:43,579

going to be in Toronto in a couple of

998

00:47:53,410 --> 00:47:51,440

weeks okay okay okay as a linguist what

999

00:47:55,870 --> 00:47:53,420

do you make of the redefinition of words

1000

00:47:57,670 --> 00:47:55,880

primarily at least as far as my research

1001

00:47:59,560 --> 00:47:57,680

is shown by the campus left by the

1002

00:48:01,540 --> 00:47:59,570

grievous studies or the radical left or

1003

00:48:02,980 --> 00:48:01,550

whatever they're called such as racism

1004

00:48:05,530 --> 00:48:02,990

which is the old definition of racism

1005

00:48:07,359 --> 00:48:05,540

plus power or violence which is which

1006

00:48:09,450 --> 00:48:07,369

now incorporates speech about physical

1007

00:48:13,210 --> 00:48:09,460

violence or what constitutes a Nazi

1008

00:48:14,950 --> 00:48:13,220

because they may say well words change

1009

00:48:16,720 --> 00:48:14,960

all the time we're just changing where

1010

00:48:18,990 --> 00:48:16,730

is this which is par for the course so I

1011

00:48:22,089 --> 00:48:19,000

want to know what you think about that

1012

00:48:24,819 --> 00:48:22,099

words change all the time but it's an

1013

00:48:27,339 --> 00:48:24,829

organic bottom-up viral process it's not

1014

00:48:30,069 --> 00:48:27,349

something that an interest group can

1015

00:48:32,589 --> 00:48:30,079

engineer first of all because you've got

1016

00:48:35,079 --> 00:48:32,599

to get buy-in from several hundred

1017

00:48:39,730 --> 00:48:35,089

million English speakers and less you're

1018

00:48:41,829 --> 00:48:39,740

a a language totalitarian despot you

1019

00:48:43,809 --> 00:48:41,839

can't order people how to how to speak

1020

00:48:45,190 --> 00:48:43,819

something is catch on and in processes

1021

00:48:47,710 --> 00:48:45,200

that don't quite understands and

1022

00:48:49,650 --> 00:48:47,720

certainly if it's in the service of an

1023

00:48:51,880 --> 00:48:49,660

agenda then there's going to be a lot of

1024

00:48:54,130 --> 00:48:51,890

obvious resistance you know if I'm

1025

00:48:55,540 --> 00:48:54,140

coca-cola and I say well I'm legislating

1026  
00:48:57,130 --> 00:48:55,550  
from now on the word water will be

1027  
00:48:58,809 --> 00:48:57,140  
coca-cola so every time you want a water

1028  
00:49:00,970 --> 00:48:58,819  
at a restaurant we're gonna serve you

1029  
00:49:02,650 --> 00:49:00,980  
coca-cola billion for it and you say

1030  
00:49:04,059 --> 00:49:02,660  
wait I said that's not what water means

1031  
00:49:06,339 --> 00:49:04,069  
and I say well look words change all the

1032  
00:49:08,620 --> 00:49:06,349  
time you say no wait a second that just

1033  
00:49:11,829 --> 00:49:08,630  
sheer manipulation that's not gonna work

1034  
00:49:13,990 --> 00:49:11,839  
it and should not work and I'd say the

1035  
00:49:16,839 --> 00:49:14,000  
same thing for an interest group trying

1036  
00:49:19,210 --> 00:49:16,849  
to redefine words as people ordinarily

1037  
00:49:20,589 --> 00:49:19,220  
understand them which is the but in any

1038  
00:49:23,170 --> 00:49:20,599

case the only way in which language

1039

00:49:25,030 --> 00:49:23,180

changes any way I can speak with some

1040

00:49:26,680 --> 00:49:25,040

Authority here being the chair of the

1041

00:49:30,579 --> 00:49:26,690

usage panel of the American Heritage

1042

00:49:32,620 --> 00:49:30,589

Dictionary and when I ask my colleagues

1043

00:49:33,930 --> 00:49:32,630

of the dictionary how do you guys decide

1044

00:49:35,980 --> 00:49:33,940

what the

1045

00:49:37,510 --> 00:49:35,990

official meeting Awards is and they say

1046

00:49:40,240 --> 00:49:37,520

well we pay attention to the way people

1047

00:49:42,250 --> 00:49:40,250

use language so it's not as if any

1048

00:49:45,000 --> 00:49:42,260

authority even a dictionary board can

1049

00:49:49,359 --> 00:49:45,010

legislate language and in the case of

1050

00:49:52,870 --> 00:49:49,369

woods like like racism it it really is a

1051  
00:49:54,460 --> 00:49:52,880  
terrible idea to try to change the

1052  
00:49:57,640 --> 00:49:54,470  
meaning so that people can't even get

1053  
00:50:02,769 --> 00:49:57,650  
certain thoughts across so if you ask is

1054  
00:50:04,960 --> 00:50:02,779  
it possible for a a white powerless

1055  
00:50:07,599 --> 00:50:04,970  
unemployed working-class person in a

1056  
00:50:13,329 --> 00:50:07,609  
poor southern in order Appalachian town

1057  
00:50:15,640 --> 00:50:13,339  
to be have derogatory opinions about

1058  
00:50:17,890 --> 00:50:15,650  
african-americans and you say oh no we

1059  
00:50:20,170 --> 00:50:17,900  
can't ask if he's racist because racist

1060  
00:50:22,710 --> 00:50:20,180  
means that you have to have power well

1061  
00:50:25,329 --> 00:50:22,720  
you can that's the question and

1062  
00:50:29,099 --> 00:50:25,339  
similarly to say that it is impossible

1063  
00:50:31,359 --> 00:50:29,109

for an African American to have

1064

00:50:34,180 --> 00:50:31,369

beginning thoughts about Asians or

1065

00:50:36,910 --> 00:50:34,190

whites or for Asians to have bigoted

1066

00:50:39,640 --> 00:50:36,920

thoughts about African Americans if they

1067

00:50:42,160 --> 00:50:39,650

happen to be powerless well we put in a

1068

00:50:44,049 --> 00:50:42,170

language is to get thoughts across to

1069

00:50:46,569 --> 00:50:44,059

communicate if you try to words

1070

00:50:48,700 --> 00:50:46,579

so that certain thoughts are impossible

1071

00:50:50,920 --> 00:50:48,710

who are difficult to express then you

1072

00:50:53,650 --> 00:50:50,930

just made it impossible to get knowledge

1073

00:50:56,490 --> 00:50:53,660

and clarity about the state of the world

1074

00:50:58,380 --> 00:50:56,500

the same would be true of violence

1075

00:51:02,200 --> 00:50:58,390

metaphors are great we can talk about

1076

00:51:05,380 --> 00:51:02,210

that use anything as a metaphorical

1077

00:51:07,150 --> 00:51:05,390

sense but you really do want to make a

1078

00:51:09,400 --> 00:51:07,160

distinction between someone's saying

1079

00:51:11,859 --> 00:51:09,410

mean things on Twitter and someone

1080

00:51:14,500 --> 00:51:11,869

putting a bullet in your head or nice

1081

00:51:16,660 --> 00:51:14,510

between your ribs and say that well

1082

00:51:18,069 --> 00:51:16,670

you're not allowed to use words of the

1083

00:51:20,890 --> 00:51:18,079

distinguish those if you use the word

1084

00:51:22,779 --> 00:51:20,900

violence to refer to physical violence

1085

00:51:25,029 --> 00:51:22,789

it has to apply to verbal violence as

1086

00:51:27,190 --> 00:51:25,039

well well how are you gonna say even the

1087

00:51:29,260 --> 00:51:27,200

thought that I just said that and I just

1088

00:51:31,480 --> 00:51:29,270

expressed a namely that there is a big

1089

00:51:34,260 --> 00:51:31,490

difference between being murdered and

1090

00:51:36,640 --> 00:51:34,270

being insulted or in the case of my own

1091

00:51:39,819 --> 00:51:36,650

research that there's been an enormous

1092

00:51:42,480 --> 00:51:39,829

decline in the occurrence of physical

1093

00:51:45,099 --> 00:51:42,490

violence has there been a decline or

1094

00:51:46,980 --> 00:51:45,109

priests or no change in the amount of

1095

00:51:48,720 --> 00:51:46,990

insult

1096

00:51:50,520 --> 00:51:48,730

well that's an interesting question but

1097

00:51:52,650 --> 00:51:50,530

it's it is a separate question and the

1098

00:51:54,240 --> 00:51:52,660

point of language is we can pose that

1099

00:51:56,940 --> 00:51:54,250

question or any other question that's

1100

00:52:00,329 --> 00:51:56,950

the beauty and power of language and the

1101  
00:52:03,060 --> 00:52:00,339  
idea of trying to engineer it in a way

1102  
00:52:06,540 --> 00:52:03,070  
that advances a particular theory or

1103  
00:52:07,920 --> 00:52:06,550  
agenda or political ideology at the

1104  
00:52:11,310 --> 00:52:07,930  
expense of just being able to share our

1105  
00:52:14,550 --> 00:52:11,320  
ideas is my idea because it makes it

1106  
00:52:17,790 --> 00:52:14,560  
hard to the clarity get knowledge get

1107  
00:52:21,060 --> 00:52:17,800  
understanding but it also excludes

1108  
00:52:22,710 --> 00:52:21,070  
people from the discourse in an age in

1109  
00:52:23,460 --> 00:52:22,720  
which we're getting more polarized than

1110  
00:52:26,280 --> 00:52:23,470  
ever

1111  
00:52:28,920 --> 00:52:26,290  
more more and more people not only

1112  
00:52:31,770 --> 00:52:28,930  
disagree with others but think that they

1113  
00:52:36,210 --> 00:52:31,780

are stupid or and evil since not

1114

00:52:38,010 --> 00:52:36,220

everyone can be infallible and

1115

00:52:40,620 --> 00:52:38,020

omniscient and correct about everything

1116

00:52:42,660 --> 00:52:40,630

there's got to be room for respectful

1117

00:52:45,930 --> 00:52:42,670

disagreement trying to engineer language

1118

00:52:50,070 --> 00:52:45,940

to make that impossible is a pernicious

1119

00:52:52,290 --> 00:52:50,080

idea okay that's pretty

1120

00:52:53,910 --> 00:52:52,300

has ever worked where an organization or

1121

00:52:56,280 --> 00:52:53,920

someone from the top down imposed a

1122

00:52:57,840 --> 00:52:56,290

certain word and then it became part of

1123

00:53:01,050 --> 00:52:57,850

the dictionary because people had to use

1124

00:53:06,060 --> 00:53:01,060

it there there certainly are changes for

1125

00:53:10,380 --> 00:53:06,070

example the the title Miz as opposed to

1126

00:53:12,300 --> 00:53:10,390

the former miss missus there was a

1127

00:53:14,790 --> 00:53:12,310

campaign in the 1970s it wasn't from in

1128

00:53:16,860 --> 00:53:14,800

any organization but that that miss and

1129

00:53:18,420 --> 00:53:16,870

missus should be dropped and is they

1130

00:53:21,390 --> 00:53:18,430

should be replaced by miss I mean that

1131

00:53:24,270 --> 00:53:21,400

was for a particular political agenda

1132

00:53:28,680 --> 00:53:24,280

and it it carried the day probably

1133

00:53:31,470 --> 00:53:28,690

because it did not it actually increased

1134

00:53:33,960 --> 00:53:31,480

the utility of language there are a lot

1135

00:53:36,210 --> 00:53:33,970

of times when I I don't know if a woman

1136

00:53:37,650 --> 00:53:36,220

is married or not gonna don't care and I

1137

00:53:39,810 --> 00:53:37,660

shouldn't be the language wouldn't force

1138

00:53:41,790 --> 00:53:39,820

me to decide it kind of gets in the way

1139

00:53:46,170 --> 00:53:41,800

of communication together of course with

1140

00:53:48,090 --> 00:53:46,180

conveying the attitude that a woman's

1141

00:53:50,610 --> 00:53:48,100

marital status is an essential part of

1142

00:53:54,050 --> 00:53:50,620

her identity but that is not true of men

1143

00:53:56,160 --> 00:53:54,060

and then also been changes in words like

1144

00:53:59,130 --> 00:53:56,170

Negro which was very perfectly

1145

00:54:01,050 --> 00:53:59,140

acceptable word in the 1960s Martin

1146

00:54:03,720 --> 00:54:01,060

Luther King referred to Negroes we have

1147

00:54:05,940 --> 00:54:03,730

the United Negro College Fund that was

1148

00:54:09,210 --> 00:54:05,950

replaced by black which has been partly

1149

00:54:12,090 --> 00:54:09,220

superseded by African American and other

1150

00:54:13,890 --> 00:54:12,100

other terms for politically and

1151

00:54:15,900 --> 00:54:13,900

emotionally charged concepts like

1152

00:54:19,170 --> 00:54:15,910

crippled or people that we would now

1153

00:54:22,080 --> 00:54:19,180

call disabled and in between they were

1154

00:54:23,940 --> 00:54:22,090

handicapped so there is that kind of

1155

00:54:26,790 --> 00:54:23,950

I've called a euphemism treadmill where

1156

00:54:29,490 --> 00:54:26,800

one term replaces another again there's

1157

00:54:33,240 --> 00:54:29,500

no one who mean the legislates it it is

1158

00:54:35,910 --> 00:54:33,250

a grassroots phenomenon the catch is on

1159

00:54:39,300 --> 00:54:35,920

there again there is no particular harm

1160

00:54:41,760 --> 00:54:39,310

to clarity of communication if you call

1161

00:54:44,420 --> 00:54:41,770

someone african-american or you call

1162

00:54:46,770 --> 00:54:44,430

them black you're conveying the same

1163

00:54:49,490 --> 00:54:46,780

concepts there's a change in attitude

1164

00:54:52,380 --> 00:54:49,500

and there so it is possible for

1165

00:54:54,920 --> 00:54:52,390

fraternity to change but those are ones

1166

00:54:56,880 --> 00:54:54,930

where there was nothing particularly

1167

00:55:05,810 --> 00:54:56,890

tendentious and nothing that

1168

00:55:10,650 --> 00:55:08,520

okay thank you so much I appreciate your

1169

00:55:12,240 --> 00:55:10,660

time I appreciate them something like 16

1170

00:55:16,290 --> 00:55:12,250

hour turnaround from when you received

1171

00:55:24,420 --> 00:55:16,300

the request happy anniversary I hope you

1172

00:55:33,090 --> 00:55:24,430

do a celebrate well tonight too many

1173

00:55:34,620 --> 00:55:33,100

times more than once but the as a place

1174

00:55:36,359 --> 00:55:34,630

to celebrate I know this incredibly

1175

00:55:39,060 --> 00:55:36,369

touristy but when I go to Toronto I go

1176  
00:55:40,740 --> 00:55:39,070  
up to the top of the CN Tower the best

1177  
00:55:48,440 --> 00:55:40,750  
food in the world and a lot of tourists

1178  
00:55:55,830 --> 00:55:52,250  
oh well I don't know if I've been here

1179  
00:55:58,320 --> 00:55:55,840  
an hour than that you know you're not

1180  
00:56:01,260 --> 00:55:58,330  
going to get your way all the time the

1181  
00:56:01,680 --> 00:56:01,270  
other person is not perfect and neither

1182  
00:56:10,349 --> 00:56:01,690  
are you

1183  
00:56:12,660 --> 00:56:10,359  
that's the ground rules that you got to

1184  
00:56:15,240 --> 00:56:12,670  
be a team that lots of people in life

1185  
00:56:18,260 --> 00:56:15,250  
are going to oppose you attack you

1186  
00:56:22,020 --> 00:56:18,270  
undermine you but what when you get home

1187  
00:56:24,000 --> 00:56:22,030  
you've got to have the solidarity of

1188  
00:56:27,930 --> 00:56:24,010

loyalty and support of your arrest I was